



CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS
MAYOR'S OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
JOSEPH A. CURTATONE
MAYOR

MICHAEL F. GLAVIN
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DETERMINATION OF SIGNIFICANCE STAFF REPORT

Site:	82 Dover Street
Case:	HPC 2012.126
Applicant Name:	Delaporte Development
Date of Application:	11/08/2012
Recommendation:	Significant
Hearing Date:	December 18, 2012

I. Historical Association

Architectural Description:

The subject property, c. 1874, is a 2½ story two-family dwelling that is three bays wide with a brick foundation, vinyl siding, and replacement windows and doors. The structure has an enclosed porch on the front façade, a two story enclosed porch on the left side façade, and a rear ell with two chimneys and a small shed roofed addition. This dwelling likely represents the Italianate style by the two-story polygonal bay on the primary and right side façades and deep eaves, in combination with the period of construction.



Front and left side façades of 82 Dover Street



Historical Description:

Dover Street is listed in the 1869 directory; however, the owner of 82 Dover Street is unknown. The 1874 Hopkins Map (Plate K) lists the address as 40 Dover Street and the owner as K. W. Chapman, a carpenter, who is not listed prior to the directory of 1873. The 1881 directory lists Jonathan F. Tobey, an engineer who works on Cornhill Street in Boston, as the owner. Three years later, according to the Hopkins map of 1884 (Plate 14), George W. Ross, an electric light operator on Congress Street in Boston, owns the subject property. Eliza Ross is the owner by 1895 but is not listed in the 1895 directory.

The next known owner is Reverend Walter Scott in 1910 and by 1915, Philip Goduti, a cigar clerk in Boston, owns this property. The current address, #80, is assigned after 1925. The subject parcel remains in the Goduti family through 1955; however, by 1937 Fillippo (Philip) and Fermo establish Goduti Wineries. Philip is the proprietor while Fermo is the bookkeeper. Minutes from a 1937 Board of Alderman meeting adopt an order that allows for a curb cut and a thirty foot driveway to be constructed on the southeasterly side of 100 Properzi Way (then known as Vine Street), which is occupied in 1937 by Goduti Wineries. This wine manufacturing enterprise continues throughout the 1950s.

Architect: The architect or builder of the subject structure is unknown; however, the builder could be K. W. Chapman, the first owner who was also a carpenter.

Context/Evolution:

The building first appears on the 1874 Hopkins Map (Plate K) with a rear ell, or addition, which projects from the left side, similar to the current form. A stable is also illustrated in the right corner at the back of the parcel. The 1895 Stadley Map shows the two-story polygonal bay on the primary façade. The 1900 Sanborn map (sheet 12) illustrates an open porch on the left side. The 1933 Sanborn Map (sheet 203) explains that this porch is now two stories, but still open. The rear ell has been modified, although the projecting bay remains, and a small addition has been added to the right side of the modified rear ell. Additionally, a small outbuilding has been constructed behind the stable, which is now a garage.

Dover Street was platted in 1847 by George Meacham as part of a 43-lot subdivision. The Dover streetscape, predominantly composed of two story gable end dwellings, illustrates the suburbanization that occurred in West Somerville at the end of the 19th century. This basic form is the same for many houses in this area and the architectural elaboration (brackets, decorative shingles, polygonal bays, and porches) add variety and interest to the streetscape.

The subject building is located within a context of buildings and structures which predominantly reflect the development of this neighborhood as a commuter suburb. However, the subject parcel, located approximately 500 feet from Davis Square, is adjacent to the commercial and industrial development that encroaches into this clearly defined residential neighborhood. Additionally, a modern apartment building is located directly across the Street.



Dover Streetscape looking south

Summary:

The building is potentially of the Italianate style, but is clad in vinyl siding with replacement windows and doors. A twentieth century addition modified the original rear ell and added a small shed roofed massing to the right side of the rear addition. There are no existing outbuildings.

Findings on Historical Association

*For a Determination of Significance, the subject building must be found either (a) **importantly associated with people, events or history** or (b) historically or architecturally significant (Ordinance 2003-05, Section 2.17.B). Findings for (b) can be found at the end of the next section.*

(a) In accordance with the historic information obtained from *Findings on Historical Association*, which utilizes historic maps/atlasses, City reports and directories, and building permit research, and through an examination of resources that document the history of the City, such as *Somerville Past and Present*, Staff find 82 Dover Street to be importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City or the Commonwealth.

The subject building is found importantly associated with the Goduti family, 1915-1955, and with the broad architectural, cultural, economic and social history of the City due to the association of the property with the Goduti family and their wine manufacturing enterprise at 100 Properzi Way (Vine Street) and as a two-story gable end dwelling that is a comprehensive component of the residential portion of the Dover streetscape which, as a context of buildings, illustrates the suburbanization of West Somerville at the end of the 19th century.

II. Historical and Architectural Significance

The findings for historical and/or architectural significance of a historic property address the period, style, method of building construction and association with a reputed architect or builder of the subject property, either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures (Ordinance 2003-05, Section 2.17.B).

The period of significance for 82 Dover Street begins at the time of construction, c. 1873, as West Somerville was largely developed for commuter housing. This period of significance extends into the twentieth century as this building and the south end of the Dover streetscape continue to illustrate the suburban development of this neighborhood.

This building illustrates possible characteristics of the Italianate style with a wood frame and is not found to be associated with a reputed architect or builder. The building is located within a context of buildings or structures which, together, create a setting that reflects the character of the place in which the subject building played a historical role, i.e. the suburbanization of West Somerville.

Integrity

The National Park Service identifies historic integrity as the ability of a property to convey significance. A property should possess sufficient integrity to convey, represent or contain the values and qualities for which it is judged significant; therefore, the following is an identification

and evaluation of these qualities and alterations as they affect the ability of the subject property to convey significance.

- a. **Location:** The location of the subject two-family dwelling is along the left side lot line of a square-shaped lot with 61 feet of street frontage. This location has not been altered and five additional lots, located on either side of the subject parcel, are also positioned along their left side lot line.
- b. **Design:** The current design of the building suggests that originally the structure was three bays in width with a side hall entry interior plan. While the front and left side façades have been modified, the original design intent is still visible on the right side façade, which implies the main building is two rooms deep. Other than the depth of the eaves and the two story polygonal bays on the front and right side façades, architectural elements with regard to design are not visible.
- c. **Materials:** The materials that compose this dwelling represent preferences of those who created the dwelling as well as later owners and occupants. While a majority of the material is wood with a brick foundation, later materials added include vinyl siding, replacement windows and doors, and asphalt shingles. Although original elements could remain beneath the current siding, there is little evidence that suggests this is true as window casings are difficult to detect and a letter from the Applicant explains that a large amount of detail has been either removed or ruined.
- d. **Alterations:** The two-story rear addition with the small shed roof massing on the right side of this addition is c.1933. Other alterations include the enclosure of the front porch and two-story left side porch as well as the siding, replacement windows and doors, and asphalt shingles.

Evaluation of Integrity:

Alterations, such as replacement windows and doors as well as siding and asphalt shingles, have modified the exterior appearance of this two-family dwelling over the years. The enclosure of two porches and the additions of the rear ell and the small shed roof component have also altered the massing of this structure; however, these components also illustrate the evolution of this structure and do have the potential to be reversed.

Qualities that continue to convey significance include the location of the building on the parcel and the spatial relationship to other buildings along Dover Street. The building moderately retains integrity of design, through the right side fenestration pattern and side hall interior plan. Integrity of material is unlikely, but possible, and though the massing has been altered, the form of the structure is still clear and remains consistent with the development of the streetscape.

Findings for Historical and Architectural Significance

*For a Determination of Significance, the subject building must be found either (A) importantly associated with people, events or history or (b) **historically or architecturally significant** (Ordinance 2003-05, Section 2.17.B). Findings for (a) can be found at the end of the previous section.*

(b) In accordance with the *Finding on Historical and Architectural Significance*, which addresses period, style, method of building construction, and association with a reputed architect

or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures, as well as integrity, which assess the ability of the property to convey significance, Staff find 82 Dover Street historically or architecturally significant.

The subject building is found historically and architecturally significant due to the ability of the subject parcel to convey significance regarding location and form as well as, to a moderate degree, integrity of design.

III. Recommendation

Recommendations are based upon an analysis by Historic Preservation Staff of the permit application and the required findings for the Demolition Review Ordinance, which requires archival and historical research, and an assessment of historical and architectural significance, conducted prior to the public meeting for a Determination of Significance. This report may be revised or updated with a new recommendation and/or findings based upon additional information provided to Staff or through further research.

For a Determination of Significance, the structure must be either (A) listed on the National Register or (B) at least 50 years old.

(A) The structure is NOT listed on or within an area listed on the National Register of Historic Places, nor is the structure the subject of a pending application for listing on the National Register.

OR

(B) The structure, circa 1873, is at least 50 years old.

AND

For a Determination of Significance under (B), the subject building must be found either (a) importantly associated with people, events or history or (b) historically or architecturally significant.

(a) In accordance with the *Findings on Historical Association*, which utilizes historic maps/atlasses, City reports and directories, and building permit research, and through an examination of resources that document the history of the City, **Staff recommend that the Historic Preservation Commission find 82 Dover Street importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City or the Commonwealth.**

OR

(b) In accordance with the *Findings on Historical and Architectural Significance*, which addresses period, style, method of building construction, and association with a reputed architect or builder, either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures, as well as integrity, the ability to convey significance, **Staff recommend that the Historic Preservation Commission find 82 Dover Street historically and architecturally significant.**

82 Dover Street

